

Military Commissions Act of 2006 / Competing Graham-McCain-Warner bill should be passed

< Military Commissions Act of 2006

The printable version is no longer supported and may have rendering errors. Please update your browser bookmarks and please use the default browser print function instead.

Position: Competing Graham-McCain-Warner bill should be passed

This position addresses the topic Military Commissions Act of 2006.

For this position

“ President Bush is pushing aggressively for quick action on his bill. But the Senate needs to work from its own, far better, draft -- which, with relatively few changes, could provide a sound legislative basis for fair and orderly trials.”

From A Solution for Trials, by The Washington Post editorial board (*The Washington Post*, September 9, 2006) ([view](#))

“ In the long run, victory in the War on Terrorism will go not to the vengeful, but to the just, to the winner of the Battle of Ideas. By trying these 14 prisoners in front of a court that affords them basic legal protections, the United States would demonstrate the strength and superiority of freedom under the rule of law.”

From Vengeance V. Victory, by St. Louis Post-Dispatch editorial board (*St. Louis Post-Dispatch*, September 8, 2006) ([view](#))

“ On Wednesday in a speech in which the president admitted the existence of secret CIA prisons overseas, Bush asked Congress to fight terrorism on his terms. Those means and methods have been repudiated by the U.S. Supreme Court and legions of civil and military legal experts.”

From Hold Bush to the Law in Terror-Suspect Cases, by The Seattle Times editorial board (*The Seattle Times*, September 8, 2006) ([view](#))

“ The moral basis of our fight against terrorism has already been undercut in the eyes of much of the world by the excesses of Abu Ghraib, Guantanamo, and Bagram Airbase outside Kabul. If people continue to question the moral base of our war against terrorists, then the very intelligence we seek and desperately need will start to dry up.”

From Fighting for our honor, by H.D.S. Greenway (*The Boston Globe*, September 19, 2006) ([view](#))

“ "This will become an important fight over whether the nation will give in to fear to protect itself, knowing, according to Sen. McCain, that coerced evidence isn't reliable. Or whether it will abide by long-standing human-rights treaties that protect everyone, including Americans who depend on it in wartime." ”

From GOP Stand Against Torture, by Bangor Daily News editorial board (*Bangor Daily News*, September 16, 2006) (view)

“ "Three Republican senators -- John W. Warner of Virginia, chairman of the Armed Services Committee; Lindsey O. Graham of South Carolina; and Mr. McCain -- are bravely promoting an alternative measure that would allow terrorists to be questioned and tried without breaking faith with traditional U.S. values." ”

From A Defining Moment for America, by The Washington Post editorial board (*The Washington Post*, September 15, 2006) (view)

“ "To authorize trials that needlessly depart from international norms will only invite skepticism about the convictions they deliver, further degrade the United States in the eyes of the world, and make martyrs of those condemned to prison or death. Cooperation with allies, vital to stopping future terrorist attacks, will be seriously impeded." ”

From A Crucial Choice, by The Washington Post editorial board (*The Washington Post*, September 14, 2006) (view)

Against this position

“ "Does any sane adult believe the cutthroats we are dealing with will respect the Geneva Convention? Or that our extension of Geneva Convention rights to them will be seen as anything other than another sign of weakness and confusion that will encourage them in their terrorism?" ”

From Suicidal hand-wringing, by Thomas Sowell (*The Washington Times*, September 21, 2006) (view)

“ "Tough questioning, such as "waterboarding" or simulated drowning, makes terrorists talk. That's how U.S. interrogators encouraged Khalid Sheik Mohammed to detail how he masterminded al Qaeda's September 11 attacks. He then ratted out Hambali, the man behind the October 2002 Bali bombing that killed 202, and "dirty bomber" Jose Padilla. Both are now safely in custody." ”

From Being Nice Will Get Us Killed, by Deroy Murdock (*National Review*, September 21, 2006) (view)

“ "To be blunt: The compromise proposed by the three senators takes the administration's proposals as a starting point and then proceeds to roll back only a few of its more odious provisions." ”

From Compromised, by The New Republic editorial board (*The New Republic*, September 21, 2006) (view)

“ “Both bills choke off judicial review and allow even those acquitted by a military tribunal to be held indefinitely. Either bill might be acceptable if the United States government were infallible. As it is, they would legalize the sorts of abuses of power that the United States fought against in other countries for most of the 20th century.” ”

From Rules for the Real World, by The New York Times editorial board (*The New York Times*, September 20, 2006) (view)

“ “We are not engaged in battle with any particular nation that might claim signatory status to the Geneva Conventions. We are not fighting any uniformed entity that remotely aspires to the pleasantries enumerated within. As such, it is tragically inane to hear United States senators whine about our obligations to afford terrorist combatants certain dignities out of fear of what enemy captors might do to us.” ”

From How should this country treat its terror suspects?, by Mark Davis (*The Dallas Morning News*, September 20, 2006) (view)

“ “We agree with Sen. McCain that aggressive interrogation techniques tend to be unproductive and ought not be used. We also agree with him that in extraordinary circumstances, aggressive techniques should be an option. We disagree that Congress ought to outlaw these techniques for the primary goal of enhancing America's reputation.” ”

From 'Whatever it takes': Protecting America is a dirty job, by New Hampshire Union Leader editorial board (*New Hampshire Union Leader*, September 19, 2006) (view)

“ “McCain and Co. have a case of treaty fetishism. That is the belief that a piece of paper will alter the behavior of thugs. But a government will abide by the Geneva Conventions only if it is civilized; and if it is civilized, it is unlikely we will be fighting it, which is why we don't have to worry about defending ourselves from, say, the Danes.” ”

From McCain's Dubious High Ground, by Rich Lowry (*National Review*, September 19, 2006) (view)

“ “The key political fact is this: A GOP candidate can say he will vote to authorize interrogations that CIA director Hayden (no partisan gunslinger) says are important. The Democrats, by contrast, support legislation that would bring such interrogations to a stop.” ”

From The Trap, by William Kristol (*The Weekly Standard*, September 18, 2006) (view)

“ “What's more, the definition of an "outrage" is context-dependent. What's outrageous when dealing with the likes of 9/11 mastermind Khalid Sheikh Mohammed, or a terrorist who might know about imminent plots, is clearly different than what's outrageous when dealing with a lawful combatant or prisoner of war.” ”

From Geneva Contention, by The Wall Street Journal editorial board (*The Wall Street Journal*, September 18, 2006) (view)

“ “We are not, and the administration is not, advocating torture. But there are, manifestly, methods of coercion that, though rougher than the Miranda standards of the criminal- and military-justice systems, fall short of torture. ¶...¶ Those methods will be effectively outlawed if Congress does not act.” ”

From Tortured Debate, by National Review editorial board (*National Review*, September 18, 2006) (view)

“ “We are not at war with the al-Qaida Women's Knitting Club. Even if we had all terror suspects flown first-class to Chicago and interrogated on Oprah Winfrey's couch it would not reduce by one iota the enemy's resolve to bring our civilization to a bloody end by the most barbaric means.” ”

From Playing nice: A luxury we can't afford, by New Hampshire Union Leader editorial board (*New Hampshire Union Leader*, September 17, 2006) (view)

“ “Leave aside the question of whether the rogue states confronting America today would ever afford decent treatment under any circumstances. Since actual torture is already illegal, it would be helpful if Mr. Warner, et al., could explain what interrogation methods or punishment they object to [...] even if it lessens the likelihood of preventing the next attack on Washington or on U.S. servicemen in Kabul or Baghdad.” ”

From A skewed view of detainee rights, by The Washington Times editorial board (*The Washington Times*, September 15, 2006) (view)

“ “Stamped by the fear of looking weak on terrorism, lawmakers are rushing to pass a bill demanded by the president that would have minimal impact on antiterrorist operations but could cause profound damage to justice and the American way.” ”

From Stampeding Congress, by The New York Times editorial board (*The New York Times*, September 15, 2006) (view)

“ “The whole point of the Geneva Conventions is reciprocity: Nations agree that when they fight wars, they will do so in accordance with some civilized rules. Extending the conventions' protection to terrorists, who reject those rules, transforms Geneva into a suicide pact.” ”

From For McCain, It's Personal, by James Taranto (*Best of the Web Today*, September 15, 2006) (view)

“ “The universal, reciprocal chivalry that guided warriors, and nation-states, when young John McCain's unflinching valor blazed its legend on the honor-roll of American heroes no longer obtains. Now, the enemy is barbaric, and the only weapon is intelligence.” ”

From Enact the President's Code for Military Commissions, by Andrew C. McCarthy (*National Review*, September 13, 2006) (view)

Mixed on this position

No results

Retrieved from

"https://discoursedb.org/w/index.php?title=Military_Commissions_Act_of_2006/_Competing_Graham-McCain-Wa

rner_bill_should_be_passed&oldid=3115"

This page was last edited on September 17, 2006, at 19:58.

All text is available under the terms of the GNU Free Documentation License.